Participatory budgeting in Russia

Anna Sukhova
World Bank
• Various PB models
  • including regional, municipal, school student PBs

• Focus on inclusive PB models with engagement of special groups
  • school students, youth, people with disabilities, ethnic minorities, etc.

• Building new collaborative partnerships
  • World Bank – National level governments – Regional level governments – Protect Centers – Local consultants – Volunteers
RUSSIAN FEDERATION

Federal subjects (regions): Oblasts (46), Republics (22), Krais (9), Autonomous okrugs (4), Autonomous oblasts (1)

Federal cities

80+

Higher-level Municipalities

588 Urban districts (cities)

1,758 Municipal districts (rayons)

3 Urban districts with intra-city division

267 Intra-city municipalities

Lower-level Municipalities

1,538 Urban settlements

17,772 Rural settlements

19 Intraurban districts

RUSSIA ADMINISTRATIVE STRUCTURE
2007: first Russia PB - WB Local Initiatives Support Program (LISP) started in Stavropol region

WB LISP in Stavropol and Kirov regions

WB LISP in 8 regions

National level MoF - WB PB project has started

Various methodologies; WB LISP prevailing (30 regions)
INTER-INSTITUTIONAL COLLABORATION

- Project centers (!)
- Knowledge sharing and networking
- International knowledge exchange
- Methodological support to regions
- Monitoring and results evaluation

Local level:

- Implementing agency
- World Bank (strategic consultant)
- Consultants (project center)
- Volunteers
MAIN RUSSIA PB MODELS / PRACTICES

**LISP**
- Local Initiatives Support Program by the World Bank
  - since 2007

**PORT**
- Citizen-led Territorial Development by Sakhalin region and the World Bank
  - since 2017

**MUNICIPAL PB**
- Municipal PB model by the World Bank
  - since 2019

**SCHOOL PB**
- PB program for high school students
  - since 2017
LISP
LOCAL INITIATIVES SUPPORT PROGRAM
LOCAL INITIATIVES SUPPORT PROGRAM (LISP)

- Small and medium size municipalities, mainly rural
- Small projects (20-30K USD) aimed at improvement of local level social infrastructure and territorial improvement
LISP DESIGN

- **Two-stage approach to project selection**
  1. Nomination of project proposals in municipalities – based on citizens’ voting
  2. Competition between municipal proposals – based on a set of formal criteria (share of population supported the project, contribution to projects by population and business, etc.)
    - 75-80% of municipal proposals voted by people are finally approved
- **Co-financing by population and business (cash and in-kind)**
IDENTIFICATION OF PROJECT IDEAS
FINAL MEETINGS - VOTING ON PROJECTS
KEY LISP OUTCOMES

LISP MAIN RESULTS

Over 15,000 projects implemented

- 26% ROADS
- 20% WATER SUPPLY
- 11% COMMUNITY CENTERS AND LIBRARIES
- 9% CHILDREN PLAYGROUNDS AND RECREATION FACILITIES
- 9% TERRITORIAL IMPROVEMENT

Regional budget
- Municipal budget: 20%
- Population contribution: 8%
- Local business contribution: 12%

20% co-financing by local communities
EXAMPLES OF IMPLEMENTED PROJECTS: WATER SUPPLY

Tver Oblast 2013

Kirov Oblast 2010

Kirov Oblast 2010
EXAMPLES OF IMPLEMENTED PROJECTS: ROADS

Kirov Oblast
2012

Tver Oblast, 2014

Stavropol Krai,
2010
EXAMPLES OF IMPLEMENTED PROJECTS: COMMUNITY CENTERS

Tver Oblast, 2014

Stavropol Krai, 2012

Kirov Oblast 2012
EXAMPLES OF IMPLEMENTED PROJECTS: CHILDREN’S PLAYGROUNDS

Khabarovsk Krai
2014

Stavropol Krai, 2007

Tver Oblast, 2013

Stavropol Krai, 2013 г.

Kirow Oblast, 2012

Republic of Bashkortostan, 2014
PORT
CITIZEN-LED TERRITORIAL DEVELOPMENT
• Co-designed by the World Bank and MOF of Sakhalin Oblast in 2017

• A mix of LISP, Cascais (Portugal) and Brazilian PB models

• Participants: urban and sub-urban areas

• Big infrastructure projects
  • Up to USD 1.5 mln per project
  • USD 15 mln – total budget
• **Two-level public discussions:**
  1. Preliminary meetings in communities (with direct participation of citizens)
  2. Final meetings of community delegates
• **All-region on-line voting**
  Authentication through the official national platform for public services (GosUslugi)
(1) Discussion of community project ideas in small groups
- One small group consists of 7-9 delegates.
- Delegates from the same community are placed in different groups.
- The group includes other members (non-delegates).
Each delegate may vote for two project proposals (including those proposed by their constituent communities).

Meetings are moderated by trained volunteers.

Once the delegates cast their votes, a range of finalized project proposals is made.

Two proposals per each municipality which scored the highest number of votes are submitted for public voting at the regional level.
Face-to-face stationary and mobile voting stations

- Stationary offices in municipal administrations and public areas
- “Participatory bus”
- Mobile voting stations in other municipalities (optional). To enable it, administrations must provide vehicles and draft a bus schedule to reach out to communities (including communities with less than 100 residents).

On-line voting

- Through pib.sakhminfin.ru using a 4-digit code sent to the mobile phone or an SMS;
- Available to residents willing to register at the public services website or those who are already registered
SCHOOL STUDENT PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING
THE OBJECTIVE OF CHILDREN AND YOUTH PB

- Developing soft skills - communication, presentation, teamwork, leadership
- Identification of “fresh” ideas from the youth
- Preparation to the “general” PB

NOT the development of infrastructure with the help of youth (there are other mechanisms to do it), BUT the development of young people
• Started in 2017 with Sakhalin “Youth budget”

• Currently implemented in 7 regions (over 50 municipalities, over 300 processes)

• Funded mainly from regional (sub-national) budgets, implemented by schools in coordination with municipalities
MAIN PARAMETERS

Key actors:

• Youth committees (5-7 activists per school)
• Curators in schools, curators in municipalities
• All students of 3 higher grades

Types of projects

• Any type of projects within responsibilities of municipalities and/or schools
• Any number of projects per school within US$5-50K threshold
PB IN A SUMMER CAMP (YANAO, RUSSIA)

PB SHIFT
in the summer camp “Snowflake”, Tyumen Oblast
July 22 – Aug. 02, 2019
“Laboratory of Cozy Yamal”

- Children are Laboratory Experts
- Acquaintance with PB, “Cozy Yamal” and School PB
- Going through all the stages from idea to project selection
- Format - master classes for children, general camp events and a master class for counselors
MUNICIPAL PB MODELS
1. PBs are designed, financed and implemented by municipalities

2. Models vary in different types of municipalities:
   - Municipal district (municipality consisting of several settlements)
   - City or big town
   - Small settlements

3. Region (jointly with the World Bank) provides methodological support to municipalities, ensures quality and awards grants to the leading municipalities
PB EUSP IN ST. PETERSBURG: “YOUR BUDGET”

Lectures to budget commission members

Budget Commission meetings

Projects
TEMPORARY HEATING STATION
FOR HOMELESS
VASILEOSTROVSKY DISTRICT, SAINT-PETERSBURG

- Joint project with Charity Organization “Nochlezhka”
- Heated tent can hold about 50 people, who have the opportunity to warm up, sleep, drink hot tea, get dinner and breakfast
- Not difficult to find a tent - signs are placed in the nearby territory
- The station is open from 8 p.m. to 8 a.m. from October 1 until March 31

First year statistics:
✓ Unique visitors: 413;
✓ Total spent the night: 4102;
✓ Average amount per day in a tent: 23 persons;
✓ 88% - men, 12% - women.
FOCUS ON INCLUSIVE PB MODELS WITH ENGAGEMENT OF SPECIAL GROUPS
(school students, youth, people with disabilities, ethnic minorities, etc.)
People with disabilities in Russia

- 12.1 million of disabled people
- Families with disabled people ≈ ¼ of population
- Near 24% of people with disabilities live alone

Excluded from social life!
Why?

1. Accessible environment
   - Room for improvement in terms of accessibility
   - Top-down approach in creating accessible environment
Why?

2. Insufficient level of tolerance in the society

• 61% of population consider that people with disabilities should be treated in the same way as ordinary people

National programs:
• State Program “Assessable environment” 2011-2020 (2025)
• Employment for working age disabled population
• Rehabilitation equipment and services
• Inclusive education
Where we are now in terms of inclusive PB?

Selected projects on improving assessible environment and/or creating space for socialization of disabled people

(1) Demand for inclusive projects;
(2) Need for strategic and comprehensive approach in engagement of people with disabilities
Strategic approach to engaging people with disabilities in PB

HOW TO ENSURE …..

• Effective information campaign for people with disabilities

• Participation of people with disabilities in:
  ○ Generation of project ideas
  ○ Discussion of proposals
  ○ Voting for projects
Sakhalin oblast
Outreach and information

- Individuals
- NGOs and public organizations
Sakhalin oblast
Submission and discussion of project ideas

RESULTS:

✓ **1 project proposal per community** to be put up for voting at the meeting of delegates at the municipal level

✓ **3 delegates per community** to participate in the meeting of delegates at the municipal level
Additional meeting of the members of public organizations working with people with disabilities

- 3 delegates are selected to attend the final meeting of delegates at municipal (urban district) level
Sakhalin oblast
Discussion of project ideas and preliminarily voting

RESULTS:

✔ 2 project proposals per each municipality to be put up for voting at the general regional meeting
Role of delegates from people with disabilities at the final meetings of delegates at the municipal (urban district) level

- **Participation in discussion** (universal design / assessible environment)
- **Voting** (2 votes per each delegate)
THANK YOU!

Anna Sukhova
World Bank

asukhova@worldbank.org
+1 202 250 94 52
+7 906 092 58 75